Presentation of Twin Cities German Immersion School to Heritage Preservation Commission

Research, Analysis, and Presentation Compiled by Board of Directors, Executive Director, Community Members
Twin Cities German Immersion School

November 5, 2018
1983 Historic Site Survey: St. Andrew’s *Not* Eligible for Designation

- At the time of this report, the church was still used as a church and was intact with stained glass windows, altar, crosses on towers, statues, and deemed not historic.

### Historic Sites Survey

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ramsey County Historical Society</th>
<th>Saint Paul Heritage Preservation Commission</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Street Address/Location:</strong></td>
<td>1051 W. Como Avenue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. District/village:</strong></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Common name:</strong></td>
<td>St. Andrew’s Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Historic name:</strong></td>
<td>St. Andrew’s Church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Original use:</strong></td>
<td>church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Present Use:</strong></td>
<td>church</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7. Access:</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>40. Location of architect’s drawings:</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>41. On National Register?</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>42. National Register potential?</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>43. HPC/local historic site?</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>44. Local designation potential?</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>45. In historic district?</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>46. Historic district potential?</strong></td>
<td>Yes X No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

If yes, explain rationale:
St. Andrew’s was NOT recommended for further designation study in the 2001 St. Paul Historic Context Study of Churches (report prepared for the HPC)

- St. Andrew’s NOT on the list of churches recommended for designation.
- Only one line mentions St. Andrew’s in the whole document.
- “In general the architectural quality of the remaining historic buildings is very high, with a number designed by the city’s leading architects. Most buildings remain in their original use. As a building type, however, churches face special challenges in adaptive reuse. A few former churches have been made into houses or apartments, while other stand vacant.”
16 Church Buildings Recommended for further designation study in 2001

Hausler Church Designated?

The Aula is NOT on the list.

Historic Context: Churches, Synagogues, and Religious Organizations

Landscape Research / BRW / 2001 /
The Catholic Church deemed St. Andrew’s NOT historical

• Before the building could be put up for sale, the church had to prepare it for secular use as put forth in Cannon Laws 122, 161, 166, et al. Additionally, they had to follow guidelines set by the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops.

Catholic Church reorganization plan draws anger, sorrow

The emotions swept through parishes across the archdiocese Saturday as it unveiled its most dramatic restructuring in decades, closing 21 churches and merging congregations into 14 parishes.

By ROSE FRENCH Star Tribune | OCTOBER 17, 2010 — 7:25AM

"Heartbroken and bitter, Peg Vogt listened to her priest at St. Paul’s Church of St. Andrew deliver Saturday’s homily about the Archdiocese of St. Paul and Minneapolis’ plan to shutter her church and 20 others."

'The needs of the times'
Of the 21 churches slated to be merged into other parishes, six are in St. Paul and five in Minneapolis. The rest are in suburbs, exurbs or small towns. Diocesan officials say a disproportionate number of parishes and school buildings are in areas where the population is no longer able to sustain more than one parish or school. Maintaining too many aging buildings is a financial burden the archdiocese has tried to address with the plan.
Along with declining attendance, many Twin Cities churches facing closings and mergers have something else in common — old boilers or furnaces, leaky roofs, deferred maintenance. Those were among the factors driving the closure of St. Paul’s Episcopal Church, a landmark church that couldn’t stem the tide of financial loss.
Heritage follows a Parish not the Building

“The Church is not primarily about buildings; it is about people and relationships fostered...” (Page 1)

“In short, a parish is a community of people, while a church is a building, when the word is used as it is here to describe a structure. (Page 12)

The Most Reverend John C. Nienstedt Archbishop of Saint Paul and Minneapolis
Excerpts from Letter about Strategic Plan, Oct. 17, 2010

The parish is what retains the history, culture, heritage, and legacy; The church does not.

Put simply, a parish is the community while the church is the building. “The parish is the community of God’s faithful that’s been called together,” said Msgr. Eugene Lozinski, chancellor for the Diocese of New Ulm who also holds a degree in canon law. The church, on the other hand, “would be the locus – or the place – where this community would gather to worship and celebrate the sacraments and hear the Word of God.”

One of the most important parts of the Code’s definition of a parish is what isn’t there, Hendrickson said. Nowhere does it state that a church building is a necessary part of a parish, such that if the church ceased to exist, the parish would cease to exist.

Citation: Patet, S. What is a parish? What is a church?
The Prairie Catholic / March 2014 https://www.dnu.org/what-is-a-parish-what-is-a-church/
“It is the temptation of the historian to record the story of a parish in terms of brick and mortar and neglect the living stones that are really the Church of God.”

St. Andrew’s Parish predates the 1927 St. Andrew’s Church by 30 years

• 1899 Mission Chapel-St. Andrew’s Catholic Parish dedicated

• Parish established 30 years before 1927 St. Andrew’s Church built
  • Therefore the parish cannot be inextricably tied to the St. Andrew’s Church building
TCGIS is valuable institution, serving the community and many families of new immigrants

• Several TCGIS families hail from Europe, Middle East, East Africa, India, Asia

• Archdiocese recognized need to respond to the needs of the times

The archdiocese has grown to nearly 800,000 members in the last decade, an increase fueled by immigration, with some suburban areas also seeing growth in recent years. "The church must do what the church always does -- respond to the needs of the times and strategically seek to meet these new immigrants' needs," the Rev. Peter Laird, archdiocese vicar general, said at a news conference Saturday at archdiocese headquarters in St. Paul.

Catholic Church reorganization plan draws anger, sorrow

By ROSE FRENCH Star Tribune | OCTOBER 17, 2010 — 7:25AM
1927 Church NOT the historical anchor of Warrendale

- Warrendale existed before the 1927 building (1921 Aerial photo)
- St. Andrew’s former church present - this could be viewed as the REAL anchor but was demolished by the parish to build new church
- 1927 St. Andrew’s not present, Warrendale was NOT developed around that church, and required the removal of as many as six properties when it was built
- **Curvilinear roads** present BEFORE the church, not BECAUSE of the church

Location of original St. Andrew’s in Warrendale Plan with curvilinear roads

Warrendale planned without church at Oxford and Cross (current Como)
• Under Canon Law, the Aula is not a church.

• In addition to being desanctified, it is not a designated place for divine worship.

• Additionally, the parish is what retains the history, culture, heritage, and legacy; The church does not.

Photo: AARON LAVINSKY
St. Paul school ready to part with its repurposed old church, but neighborhood isn't
Officials with the Twin Cities German Immersion School say repairs to the 1927 building would be too expensive.
By James Walsh Star Tribune
MARCH 27, 2018 — 10:05PM
Two of the original buildings are already torn down

- Half of the buildings of the St. Andrew’s site already torn down- Convent and Rectory
The exterior was altered with the 2013 addition, stained glass, statues, crosses removed

Photos: SHSA FB page (left), D10 Community Council Website (right)
The application includes the designation of this ENTIRE property, which is NOT historic

• Historically Separate Buildings
• Classroom building built 1957
• Rectory is gone
• 2013 addition by Rivera Architects
• If designated, we would need HPC approval to repair a window on our 2013 addition. (Info from George Gause)
Architect?

- Millett’s AIA reference the HPC application cites as supporting evidence for the significance of the building actually attributes the building to John Wheeler or Frederick Slifer and Frank Abrahamson.

- According to a curator at the U of M Northwest Architectural Archive, "there are no items (drawings or otherwise) related to the St. Andrew’s Church in the Como neighborhood of Saint Paul" in the Charles Hausler papers, including the photos listed as "unidentified church."

- No architect is listed on the permit

- No signed architectural drawings

- Hausler was a state senator from 1923 to 1938.
  - His firm's staff might have done more designing than he did during that time.

---

This building is NOT a distinctive example of its architectural style

- Romanesque revival, more aptly termed Richardsonian Romanesque or Richardsonian Revival was common long before the construction of the current building, primarily built in the late 1800s

- Examples of churches with similar style:
  - Our Lady of Victory Chapel at Cretin-Derham Hall, Pilgrim Baptist Church, St. Thomas Aquanis Chapel at the University of St. Thomas, St. Thomas Moore Catholic Church, and The Nativity of Our Lord Catholic Church, Holy Cross and St. Boniface.
This building is NOT a distinctive example of its architectural style

• The primary architectural feature mentioned in the staff report are the rounded arches, which are in no way unique to any one style

• The pyramid hip roof structures is one of the most common styles in architecture and far less characteristic of Romanesque revival than the conical roof on rounded towers

• The interwar period saw the simplification and blending of previous revival styles for church design. These churches, including St. Andrew’s, simply do not qualify as unique or significant examples of their late 19th and early 20th century period revival counterparts.

• Multiple local examples of churches built from this interwar period share the Aula’s red brick and poured concrete facade, including the church on St. Thomas’ campus, Holy Spirit, St. Mary’s Episcopal
The exterior is NOT “Good to Very Good condition”

Based on the above, it is our opinion that the majority of the roof due to the condition of the underlayment would require replacement in its entirety.

It should be noted, that a clay tile roof such as this is considered a “water shedding roof” and not a waterproof roof. The moisture integrity of the roof assembly relies on the underlayment which is below the tiles which provide the moisture waterproofing of the assembly.

Again at random locations, spalling of the tiles is occurring. It appears that these are predominately within the color tiles. (Refer to photograph #27).

Terry Thone, RRC
Senior Consultant

Roof Spec, Inc.
2400 Prior Avenue North
St. Paul, Minnesota 55113
Exterior issues go beyond the roof

In addition to the above items, it was noted that due to “icing” about the downspout location, extensive distress to the masonry is present. (Refer to photograph #30).

It was also noted that at the masonry mullions, extensive spalling has occurred. (Refer to photographs #31 - #36).
The First St. Andrew’s Church and School prioritized the school

- The priority was clearly the school, because the church (with a capacity of 850) was designed to be in the sub-basement of the school “a little below the grade of the land…”
- “The first decade of Fr. Printon’s pastorate had begun with a congregation of 1,000 housed to worship in a church with a capacity of 300. It closed with a parish population of 1,458...in a larger but still temporary church seating 850. The decade had opened with 145 children being educated in a catechism class. It closed with the prospect of 350 students attending the first day of classes…”
- THE SCHOOL HAD SIX CLASSROOMS ON THE MAIN LEVEL AND A SINGLE AUDITORIUM ON THE SECOND LEVEL.
- By 1926 enrollment rises to 467.
- Parallels TCGIS’s Current Success Story
Only 22 Years of Alleged Significance. Not long enough. Too long ago.

• The staff report the Years of Significance: 1927-1949
  • 400 families left in 1949 for other churches
• Is “22 years of significance” enough to save the structure forever?
• TCGIS has occupied and repurposed the former church as the Aula for 5 years, \textit{one fourth} of the “time of significance”.
• Several TCGIS families with multiple kids can stay with the K-8 school for 15-20 years.
• Sending just one kid to TCGIS is 9 years with the community, nearly half the reported period of St. Andrew’s significance!

\begin{tikzpicture}
\node at (0,0) {1900}; \node at (1,0) {1910}; \node at (2,0) {1920}; \node at (3,0) {1930}; \node at (4,0) {1940}; \node at (5,0) {1950}; \node at (6,0) {1960}; \node at (7,0) {1970}; \node at (8,0) {1980}; \node at (9,0) {1990}; \node at (10,0) {2000}; \node at (11,0) {2010}; \node at (12,0) {2020}; \node at (13,0) {2030};
\node[fill=yellow!20] at (2.5,0.5) {St. Andrew’s Years of Significance};
\node[fill=blue!20] at (9,3) {TCGIS est. 2005}; \node[fill=cyan!20] at (10,3) {TCGIS moves to Como}; \node[fill=blue!20] at (12,3) {Current K Class Graduates 8th Grade};
\end{tikzpicture}
No letter of support from MN Hungarians Group for the claim St. Andrew’s is significant to the Hungarian community

- Minnesota Hungarian Website does NOT mention St. Andrews, rather it mentions the significance of church across the street (OPC) to the Hungarian community
  - St. Paul was ONE of many Hungarian immigrant hubs, not the MAIN hub
    - Hubs included Elk River, Iron Range, Minneapolis, Rochester (conversations with 2 Hungarian community members)

- At no point has the school been contacted by any Hungarian group to challenge our plans
Mayor Carter’s City Plan: People before Buildings

• **2040 comprehensive plan** places people first as a core value.

• The city uses five working principles to ensure this long-term vision can become a reality:
  - Ensure Saint Paul puts people first
  - Encourage vitality through investment, private and public alike
  - **Create accessible places where people want to connect and spend time**
  - Promote healthy living
  - Celebrate the city’s cultural diversity

• “People-centered. We are a city that puts people first, recognizes and celebrates our complex and interrelated histories, and treasures our young and older residents as integral members of our community.”

• 2040 Plan Policy HP-1. Prioritize **publicly-owned facilities** – particularly those **owned, maintained or supported by the City** and related development authorities – for evaluation, designation and preservation.”